

**Civil Society Workshop on Sustainable Development and
Future Climate Politics**
7-9 October 2014, Mumbai, Maharashtra - India
Summary Report



From 7-9 October 2014, Carbon Market Watch together with civil society organizations in India organized a workshop on sustainable development and future climate politics. Co-organizers included: Bank Information Centre, Beyond Copenhagen Collective, Christian Aid, Centre for Education and Documentation (CED), Centre for Environment, Social and Policy Research (CESPR), Centre for Research and Advocacy - Manipur, CPSW, Gujarat Forum on CDM, INECC, International Rivers, LAYA, Matu Jan Sangthan, Misereor, Navrachna Samaj Sevi Sanstha, NBJK, Paryavaran Mitra, Paryavaran Vikas Kendra, People's Developments in People's Hands, Pipal Tree, the Society for the Promotion of Wasteland Development (SPWD), South Central India Network for Development Alternatives, Water Initiatives Orissa, the Timbaktu Collective and VPS Mumbai.

Over the duration of 2,5 days, 60 participants from 10 different states in India as well as Nepal discussed recent developments of climate and sustainable development policies in India and internationally with a particular focus on the role of sustainable development in a future international climate treaty. Civil society organizations representatives shared updates and insight on newest developments of international climate politics and future climate mitigation mechanisms ahead of COP 20 in Lima, Peru. Current aspects of climate change were highlighted with regard to current states of play in Nepal and India, sharing latest political developments related to carbon markets and sustainable development and in particular the respective positions of the new Indian government.



Building on the thorough experiences of participants with sustainable development benefits of Clean Development Mechanism (CDM) projects, shortcomings have been highlighted and recommendations for Indian and international climate policy were identified at a multi-stakeholder panel. These approaches were supported by case studies, pointing out and analyzing the sustainable development benefits generated by CDM projects.

Special emphasis was given to future carbon markets initiatives in India with particular focus on Nationally Appropriate Mitigation Actions (NAMAs). Capacity was built about the role of civil society in designing and implementing NAMAs in India which was followed by lively discussions reflecting considerable interest of the workshop participants on this new policy instrument and the opportunities for India in its implementation.

Concluding, participants identified action points for future activities and the need to intensify collaborations, strengthen partnerships and increase synergies between groups with expertise on different subject matters. The following issues have been highlighted in the discussions and were identified for follow-up activities:

- Participants discussed the role of COP in Lima, Peru with special regard to the effectiveness of the new climate agreement that is to be negotiated and adopted in Paris in 2015.
- Regarding the CDM, participants highlighted the need for reforms, introducing safeguards and a grievance mechanism for affected communities and individuals.
- Participants underlined the urgent need to include human rights aspects in the climate negotiations and to bring human rights language in the new climate deal.
- Civil society representative agreed to intensify their collaborations and strengthen partnerships to be able to bring forward issues in the most effective way possible.
- In that regard, representatives from six civil society organizations agreed to establish a working group with the goal to coordinate work to address issues at local, national and international level. This group will organize itself to work on important subject matters formulating demands for concrete actions from the Indian government. Exchange of information and coordination of CSO mobilization are therefore in focus of this new collaboration. It is important to notice that all members of this group are from different states in India ensuring diversity and sustainable partnerships.
- Workshop participants agreed to write an open letter to Prime Minister Modi ahead of COP20 in Lima, Peru. This letter shall bring forward demands of civil society organizations on future climate actions of the Indian government.
- Workshop participants expressed their interest in NAMAs and demanded further capacity building on this issue.

- National politics and a focus on national market mechanisms on emission reductions has been identified as crucial, also addressing climate finance on domestic level.
- It was finally agreed to continue sharing experiences and ideas for actions using existing mailing lists, e.g. the alert.india@carbonmarketwatch.org.

Below is a summary of each of the individual presentations.

Day 1, 7 October 2014

Nafisa D'Souza, Laya: Current State of Play: Climate Change, Human Rights, Sustainable Development and New Carbon Market Developments

Highlighting the severe human rights impacts that are caused by climate change such as displacements, food security as well as health impacts, Nafisa D'Souza stressed why climate change should be a major concern of Indian politics. She further underlined that India's rising emission levels are not used for community development, which is challenging future Indian climate policies to ensure equality. She pointed out the urgency to view the economic system in the perspective of human rights and highlighted the current missing connection of what civil society is demanding for future developments and the decisions taken by the government.

Eva Filzmoser, Carbon Market Watch: Big Picture Update on Carbon Market Developments and Climate Finance

Eva Filzmoser provided an overview of the current state of carbon markets, outlining drawbacks of offsetting and over-supply of carbon credits as well as highlighting the fact that new market schemes are emerging in several countries. She underlined the difficulties of offsetting under the new climate agreement in 2015 since all countries are expected to contribute to the global effort, especially emphasizing the risk of double counting. She further stressed that to achieve sustainable development objectives safeguards across all climate mechanisms are needed, including a grievance mechanism and procedures for robust public participation.

Datta Patil, Yuva Rural Association: Human Rights, Sustainable Development and Climate Policies

Datta Patil underlined that sustainable development includes important aspects such as the improvement of health standards, participation of women and their empowerment in the society, environmental protection and respect for human rights. Pointing out the close linkage between ecosystems and the enjoyment of human rights, he stated that the goal of sustainable development is to create and maintain prosperous social, economic, and ecological systems. This is one of the most important aspects for future climate policies on national as well as international level.

Pushparani Koijam, Centre for Research & Advocacy - Manipur: International Climate Negotiations & Local Reality Changes in Manipur and the North East

Pushparani Koijam presented climate change challenges in the context of Manipur and other North East Indian states. Special focus was thereby given to the construction of destructive dam projects that lead to land grabbing and destruction of agricultural lands, causing negative impacts for local communities. She emphasized the fact that interests and rights of indigenous people are not protected in a sufficient way and highlighted current shortcomings in the respective policies, such as missing reviews of mega development projects and their extensive impacts on the environment as well as livelihood of local communities. Highlighting that more mega dams will be built across rivers in Manipur and other north eastern regions of India, she stressed that rightful participation of all communities in climate change negotiations is crucial to reach a level of sustainable development.

Ram Kishan, Christian Aid: Prospects of a Low Carbon Energy Transition (Regional Study of South East Asia)

Ram Kishan underlined that energy is one of the key drivers of development. The availability of and access to clean, efficient and sustainable sources of energy can thereby stimulate economic, social and physical development leading to critical improvement in people's lives and livelihoods. He also pointed out that the least electrified areas of India are those with the most power plants. Furthermore, he highlighted the barriers that still exist for the use of renewable energy, such as a lack of public finance, grid limitations, high prices for renewable energy as well as storage and governance capacity. He emphasized that additional policy initiatives are needed in India to strengthen renewable energy as future energy source.

Dineshwar Chaudhary, JVE Nepal: Climate Change: Livelihoods, Adaption and Employment from a Nepal perspective

Dineshwar Chaudhary outlined Nepal's vulnerability to climate change as extreme climatic events are to become more common in this region. He pointed out that about 80 % of Nepal's people live in rural areas and depend on subsistence farming for their livelihoods. Therefore the future impacts of climate change are expected to have major effects on the livelihoods of the local communities. He concluded his presentation by pointing out the urgency for strong climate policies and protection of local community rights.

Ashim Roy, CMP/NTUI: Livelihoods, Adaptation and Employment from an Indian Perspective

Ashim Roy focused his presentation on the severe impacts of climate change. Highlighting the extensive influences on the environment as well as the enjoyment of human rights, he underlined that climate change requires special consideration within the development agenda. He pointed out that the right approaches and coherent policies are important drivers to ensure that considerable resources invested in adaptation could become opportunities for socially just and inclusive development. Concluding that adaptation is an important element

to deal with climate change in the future, he underlined that fair and sustainable measures can provide significant opportunities for communities.

Raman Mehta, Independent Researcher: Indian Climate Policies: An Overview of the Current State of Play and Future Developments

He highlighted that the design of the 2015 Agreement will have major consequences for human and ecological well-being; Raman Mehta underlined that a well designed climate agreement could trigger the right incentives for immediately needed action. He continued by stating that key elements that ought to be discussed at Paris in 2015 are mitigation commitments, global phase out of GHG and fossil fuel subsidies as well as adaptation. He further emphasized the need to close legal and institutional gaps to reach a meaningful and effective new climate treaty.

Ram Kishan, Christian Aid: International Climate Politics: Expectations for a Future Climate Treaty, Key Elements and Role of India

Ram Kishan provided an overview of important issues that need to be dealt with in the new climate agreement and furthermore indicated India's position in the negotiations. He stressed out that equity is one of the most important elements of a post 2020 climate deal from the Indian perspective, but also underlined the fact that India is still to put forward any equity proposal. Continuing his presentation by outlining India's domestic climate politics, he highlighted adaptation as key element in national climate policies and introduced existing national action plans.

Mahesh Pandya, Paryavaran Mitra: Example of Regional Climate Politics in India: Status Quo and Look Ahead

Mahesh Pandya gave an overview of India's approach to climate change and introduced national plans and programs that are implemented by the Indian government to respond to climate change, such as the National Action Plan on Climate Change (NAPCC) and Climate Change Action Program (CCAP). Presenting case studies of climate mitigation projects implemented in Gujarat, he highlighted shortcomings in India's climate change policies such as missing public consultations with the affected communities, a lack of accountability and transparency of implementing and current limitations in Environmental Impact Assessments.

Day 2, 8 October 2014

Ajita Tiwari, INECC: Climate Mitigation Projects and their Contribution to Sustainable Development – A Field Study

Ajita Tiwari presented a field study that was conducted by INECC. Objective of the study was an evidence based analysis of the sustainable development contribution of CDM projects using field visits as well as set out sustainable development criteria to assess the respective benefits generated. She highlighted that a wide disparity between claims made and the reality on the ground has been detected. As for recommendations for future changes in the modalities and procedures of the CDM, she underlined that a stricter definition of sustainable

development benefits is needed as well as the establishment of monitoring and grievance mechanisms.

**Enrico Rubertus, GIZ: CDM and NAMA In India – Looking Back and Looking Forward
Lack of Information on SD Impacts; No Study Exists With Primary Data**

Introducing a study on sustainable development benefit generation of CDM projects that was conducted by GIZ, Enrico Rubertus provided an overview of the respective findings and recommendations to improve sustainable development contribution of these climate mitigation projects. He thereby underlined the importance of a sustainable development impact monitoring system, a mandate and further guidance for projects to spend 2% of their CER revenues and making available best practices for individual sector projects.

Juliane Voigt, Carbon Market Watch: The CDM Benefit Tracker India – A Project by the Carbon Market Watch Network

Juliane Voigt presented the CDM Benefit Tracker India, a publicly accessible interactive map and transparent tool for the performance of CDM projects which provides information about 27 CDM projects in India. She further highlighted current shortcomings in the CDM regulations, such as missing monitoring systems for claimed sustainable development benefits and grievance mechanism for affected communities and individuals. As major findings of the CDM Benefit Tracker India she stressed that the vast majority of CDM projects do not live up to their sustainable development benefits promised in the Project Design Documents (PDDs), but on the contrary even have negative impacts on the environment and local communities.

Bindiya Nimia, FPA India: Sustainable Development Goals - Lessons Learnt and Way Forward

Bindya Nimia started her presentation by outlining strengths and shortcomings of the Millennium Development Goals. She further introduced the process of negotiations on future sustainable development goals by outlining negotiation processes and national consultation procedures as well as the role of the open working group on sustainable development goals. She provided an overview of the content of the agenda, the roles and responsibilities of different stakeholders, capacities, monitoring and accountability systems and partnerships.

Anuradha Munshi, Bank Information Centre: Safeguard Policies in Climate Finance

Anuradha Munshi focused her presentation on climate finance of climate mitigation projects with specific focus on the CDM, REDD and REDD+. She thereby highlighted the fact that monetary value is only given to GHG reductions, which is leaving aside the actual impacts on the environment and affected communities. She pointed out concerns over the involvement of banks in climate funds with special regard to the World Bank by stating that finance provided through these channels often does not contribute to sustainable development. As a significant example she mentioned the Sasan coal power CDM project.

Souparna Lahiri, All India Forum of Forest Movements: India's REDD+ Policy: Old Wine in New Bottle

Providing an overview of the REDD+ policy framework, Souprana Lahiri critically outlined its main aspects and shortcomings such as missing support for community needs. He highlighted that rights of the forest communities are jeopardized by implementing this framework due to missing sufficient safeguards.

Eva Filzmoser, Carbon Market Watch: Sustainable Development and Safeguards in UN Climate Policy

Eva Filzmoser highlighted the role of sustainable development in UNFCCC climate instruments and outlined important lessons to be learnt from the CDM. She provided an overview of the environmental and social safeguards of the Green Climate Fund such as the requirement of assessment and management of social risks and impacts. Also outlining missing safeguard systems of the CDM, she emphasized that the CDM policy framework needs to improve in order to be able to access additional financial sources. Of special importance in this regard is the improvement of the sustainable development reporting tool, the establishment of a grievance mechanism and strengthened local stakeholder consultation rules.

Enrico Rubertus, GIZ: NAMAs in the Context of Indian Climate Politics- Chances for India

Enrico Rubertus introduced the concept of Nationally Appropriate Mitigation Actions (NAMAs) to the workshop participants and provided an overview of potential NAMAs to be implemented in India. He further highlighted the sustainable development potential of selected NAMAs and outlined how a national NAMA framework could be organized in India. He underlined that for the development of a national NAMA framework and the development of selection criteria, experiences made with the CDM are of utmost importance.

Eva Filzmoser, Carbon Market Watch: NAMAs vs. CDM – A Look Ahead

Eva Filzmoser outlined the objective of NAMAs as a policy instrument in highlighting that it is following a development first approach by complying with local and national needs and generating emission reductions only as a co-benefit. She furthermore emphasized the fact that lessons learnt from the CDM, especially regarding public participation processes, guidelines on how to monitor sustainable development benefits and emission reductions are of utmost importance to guarantee a successful implementation of projects.

Stakeholder Panel on sustainable development impacts of climate policies

The panel was joined by Priyadarshani Karve from Samuchit , Manoj Pradhan from CISW and Enrico Rubertus representing GIZ. At this panel round, the panelists covered important aspects of sustainable development in climate policies by outlining the need to better integrate and define sustainable development in future agreements, highlighting the role of renewable energy and emphasizing the need to translate public input into policies by giving civil society and local communities a stronger voice. In lively discussions the workshop participants

identified key aspects of public work to be brought forward and showed special interest in NAMAs and their potential for India's future mitigation actions.

Day 3, 9 October 2014

CSO Panel on Recommendations for Future Reforms on National and International Level

The CSO panel was joined by the following panelists: Priya Karve from Samuchit, Eva Filzmoser from Carbon Market Watch, Datta Patil from Yuva Rural, Ram Kishan from Christian Aid and Nafisa D'Souza representing Laya.

Priyadarshini Karve, Samuchit: Future Reforms: An Emissions Reductions Framework Centered on Sustainability

Priyadarshini Karve underlined that a successful handling of climate change in the future can only be achieved with a better understanding of common concerns and shared responsibilities. Approaches towards achieving a sustainable future thereby have to include poverty eradication and sustainable livelihoods. She highlighted that the process of sustainable development can positively influence the creation of new opportunities, further underlining that basic education is essential for enabling the poor to access the benefits offered by development initiatives and market opportunities.

Eva Filzmoser, Carbon Market Watch: Feedback/Take-away from the Workshop

Eva Filzmoser highlighted the importance of civil society work at international and especially national level to bring forward issues of concern and to give a strong voice to affected communities. Once more outlining the shortcomings in the current CDM rules and the key role lessons learnt with the implementation of this climate mitigation tool, she encouraged civil societies to intensify collaborations, strengthen partnerships and increase synergies between groups with expertise in different subject matters to be most effective in their work.

Datta Patil, Yuva Rural: Climate Change/Finance/Mitigation and Development

Datta Patil highlighted that rural development projects are often implemented without adequate planning and consultation of local stakeholders. He outlined the complexity of climate change due to the multi-dimensional interrelated problems that are created and further stated that already marginalized groups suffer most severe impacts. Therefore, he underlined the urgency to reduce human rights violations and to bring forward climate policies that equally benefit communities. Most importantly in this regard is thereby to strengthen network skills of civil society organization at national and international level, to work with the existing tools and mechanisms in the most effective way available and to increase the reach out to the media.

Ram Kishan, Christian Aid: Debate on Climate - Kyoto could not Deliver

Ram Kishan outlined the extensive impacts of climate change on various sectors by especially underlining the human rights impacts that are about to increase in the future. He urged civil

societies to closely work together on important aspects of climate change and highlighted key role of the new climate deal to be agreed upon in Paris in 2015.

Nafisa D’Souza, Laya: The Role of Civil Society

Nafisa D’Souza emphasized the need of Indian civil society to further engage in the negotiation processes and to join forces to be able to push for meaningful outcomes of negotiations at national as well as international level. She stressed out the urgency to demand action by the international community and the national government by strengthening partnerships and exchange intelligence between civil society groups in India and internationally.

The presentation of the panelists was followed by a question and answer session as well as lively discussions of the workshop participants.

**** **